



People Directorate

Consultation Report

Report on the outcome of the statutory consultation relating to the proposed Maybole Community Campus involving the proposed closure and amalgamation of Cairn Primary School and Gardenrose Primary School and associated Early Years provision and the proposed relocation of St Cuthbert's Primary School

May 2018

CONTENTS

	Section	Page	
1.0	Introduction	3	
2.0	Considerations	3	
3.0	Outcome of the Consultation	3	
	3.1	Overview of responses to consultation	4
	3.2	Summary of the main points and views expressed during the consultation	6
	3.3	Consultation with Children	11
4.0	Report by Education Scotland	13	
	4.1	Process	13
	4.2	Education Scotland summary	13
	4.3	Responses to main points raised by Education Scotland	13
5.0	Review of the proposal	15	
	5.1	Review	15
	5.2	Omissions and inaccuracies	15
6.0	Council decision making process	15	

Appendices

Appendix 1 Summary of responses from consultation process

Appendix 2 Views/Comments expressed at public meetings

Appendix 3 Views/Comments expressed by children

Appendix 4 Education Scotland Report

1.0 Introduction

- 1.1 The Leadership Panel of South Ayrshire Council at its meeting of 13th February 2018 agreed to undertake statutory consultation on the proposed Maybole Community Campus involving the proposed closure and amalgamation of Cairn Primary School and Gardenrose Primary School and their associated Early Years Centres and the proposed relocation of St Cuthbert's Primary School.
- 1.2 The proposal document was made available to all consultees as prescribed by the Schools (Consultation)(Scotland) Act 2010 and a copy of the proposal document was available from the Council's website at www.south-ayrshire.gov.uk/consultations. The consultation process ran from 19th February 2018 to 20th April 2018, a period of more than 30 school days as required by statute.
- 1.3 As part of the consultation process, the People Directorate undertook the following activities:
 - Advertised the consultation on the Council website.
 - Placed a consultation advert in the local paper.
 - Publicised the consultation exercise and public meetings through letters to parents/carers and other prescribed stakeholders.
 - Placed copies of the proposal document in all Maybole schools, Council Offices, County Buildings, Maybole Library, Carrick Centre, Maybole Town Hall, Maybole Swimming Pool and Maybole Customer Contact Centre.
 - Undertook consultation with children.
 - Held public meetings in the Maybole primary schools from the 20th to 22nd March 2018.
 - Gathered responses using an online survey.

2.0 Considerations

The proposals that were issued for consultation were:

- 2.1 to bring all the Maybole schools together to create a new community campus within the grounds of Carrick Academy. The new campus will include Carrick Academy, St Cuthbert's Primary and the amalgamation of Cairn Primary and Gardenrose Primary and their Early Years Centres as a new non-denominational primary school and Early Years Centre, and
- 2.2 whether the new early years provision should be available on a 52 weeks basis, and
- 2.3 whether the option of including sports and leisure facilities (including a swimming pool) within the new campus should be explored.

3.0 Outcome of the Consultation

The consultation was undertaken in accordance with the Schools (Consultation) (Scotland) Act 2010 and all prescribed consultees were given an opportunity to participate in the consultation process and submit views on the proposals. In addition to this, other individuals and groups with an interest in the proposals were also given an opportunity to participate and submit their views.

Full details of the proposals were made available to consultees who were given the opportunity to answer 5 questions and provide comments.

3.1 Overview of responses to the consultation

3.1.1 There were a total of 87 written responses received (including the Diocese of Galloway) during the consultation period which is low considering the size of Maybole with a population of 4,700 people.

3.1.2 Table 1 below provides a summary of the responses to each of the questions that people were asked. Overall people were supportive of the proposals although those associated with St Cuthbert's Primary were generally against the relocation proposal. The majority of people who responded from St Cuthbert's Primary and Cairn Primary indicated that they did not like the idea of early years being available 52 weeks of the year.

Table 1.

Summary of Responses	Do you agree with the proposal to create a new community campus for Maybole Schools?			Do you agree with the proposed closure and amalgamation of Cairn Primary and Gardenrose Primary?			Do you agree with the proposed relocation of St Cuthbert's Primary?			Do you think that the option of including sports and leisure facilities (including a swimming pool) within the new campus should be explored?			Do you agree that the early years provision should be available on a 52 week basis?		
	Yes	No	No preference	Yes	No	No preference	Yes	No	No preference	Yes	No	No preference	Yes	No	No preference
Establishment															
Carrick Academy	18	0	1	18	0	1	12	4	3	16	2	1	13	3	2
Cairn Primary	13	5		12	6		10	8		13	5		6	11	1
Gardenrose Primary	16	6		16	6		14	4	4	14	4	4	11	3	8
St Cuthbert's Primary	3	13	2	6	8	4	0	16	2	7	8	3	5	10	3
Other e.g. Community	7	1	1	7	1	1	6	2	1	4	4	1	2	2	2
Total	86	25	4	59	21	6	42	34	10	54	23	9	37	29	16
%	75%	22%	3%	69%	24%	7%	49%	40%	12%	63%	27%	10%	45%	35%	20%

3.1.3 A number of the responses received included positive comments about the proposals and recognised the benefits that the campus arrangement offered. The positive responses included statements such as:

- The learning experiences/opportunities would be fantastic with all the schools being on the one campus.
- The campus would enhance community spirit.
- Better security.
- Will be great for the children.
- A lovely new super school.
- Proposal looks fantastic.
- Great that the campus will be a community hub.
- At last something is being done. Maybole schools are an eyesore.
- Modern facilities can only enhance children's learning.
- New leisure facilities are needed.
- Children and young people will be in one location.
- It would be welcomed and loved by all in the Carrick cluster.

3.1.4 Similarly, a number of respondents did not agree with the proposals and raised a number of concerns during the consultation. The main concerns raised are summarised in section 3.2 along with a response from the Council. A full summary of all the responses are shown in Appendix 1.

3.1.5 Three public meetings from 20th - 22nd March 2018 were held in the primary schools with 44 people in total attending. (Cairn Primary-14 attendees, Gardenrose Primary-21 attendees and St Cuthbert's Primary-9 attendees). The Depute Chief Executive and Director of People chaired the meeting with the Director of Place and other officers in attendance. The Depute Chief Executive and Director of People gave a presentation outlining the proposals and the consultation process. This was followed by a question/answer session. A note of the points raised and views expressed at the public meetings can be found at Appendix 2.

Overall, people who attended the public meetings found it difficult to visualise, without the aid of detailed designs, the different spaces within the campus and how they would work. The Depute Chief Executive and Director of People explained that most of the concerns would be addressed through the design process and that everyone will get an opportunity to participate and influence the designs if the proposals are approved. He referred to a number of campus buildings that he had visited and will offer people an opportunity to visit these at a later date.

3.1.6 The Catholic Church has not objected to the proposal and is willing to explore a joint campus arrangement. Their approval is subject to more discussion on the development of the campus model with significant involvement of parents and the Church. A request was made for separate entrances and a concern was raised that the St Cuthbert's Primary and Queen Margaret Academy links could be adversely affected by the proposal. The Bishop also asked that all practical measures were taken to ensure that the ethos of St Cuthbert's Primary was not weakened by the move to a campus model.

3.1.7 Consultation was also undertaken with the children at Cairn Primary, Gardenrose Primary and St Cuthbert's Primary. The schools used the consultation guidelines "Participants not Pawns" issued by Scotland's Commissioner for Children and Young People and the outcomes from the consultations are listed in Appendix 3.

3.2 Summary of the main points and views expressed during the consultation

3.2.1 Responses to the 5 consultation questions were as follows:

- (1) Do you agree with the proposal to create a new community campus for Maybole Schools?

75% of respondents agreed with the proposal, 22% did not agree with the proposal and 3% indicated no preference.

- (2) Do you agree with the proposed closure and amalgamation of Cairn Primary and Gardenrose Primary?

69% of respondents agreed with the proposal, 24% did not agree with the proposal and 7% indicated no preference.

- (3) Do you agree with the proposed relocation of St Cuthbert's Primary?

49% of respondents agreed with the proposal, 40% did not agree with the proposal and 12% indicated no preference.

- (4) Do you think that the option of including sports and leisure facilities (including a swimming pool) within the new campus should be explored?

63% of respondents agreed with the proposal, 27% did not agree with the proposal and 10% indicated no preference.

- (5) Do you agree that the early years provision should be available on a 52 week basis?

45% of respondents agreed with the proposal, 35% did not agree with the proposal and 20% indicated no preference.

3.2.2 The main issues/views gathered during the consultation period are listed below along with a response from the People Directorate

- 1) View expressed: The 3 primary schools should be combined.

Response: The Council is only consulting on the amalgamation of Cairn Primary and Gardenrose Primary. There is specific legislation in place that protects denominational schools and under this proposal St Cuthbert's Primary will remain a separate school.

- 2) View expressed: Schools should not be open plan.

Response: South Ayrshire Council's new primary schools are modelled around semi open classrooms which work very well. They are brighter with better ventilation and the teaching area feels much bigger as they tend to open onto a larger flexible area. Children can move easily between the classrooms and the flexible learning area under the supervision of the class teacher which makes the learning experience much better for the children. New schools have better acoustic measures which keep the noise to a minimum. In addition to the classrooms there will be other closed support rooms available such as general purpose rooms and learning support rooms that teachers can access throughout the day.

- 3) Question raised: If the swimming pool is incorporated into the new campus would access during the day be restricted?

Response: The new campus will be designed in such a way that the swimming pool can be accessed separately from the school. There is no reason why access to the new pool would be any different to the existing one. The necessary security will be in place which enables all the facilities to be operational at the same time while keeping children and young people safe. The access arrangements for the new swimming pool will be discussed and consulted on locally if a decision is made to incorporate the swimming pool into the new campus.

- 4) Question raised: Surely upgrading the existing swimming pool would provide better access?

Response: It is possible to upgrade the existing swimming pool but it would remain an older building. Incorporating the swimming pool in the new campus provides the opportunity for a modern swimming pool and environment to be built which will be more efficient than the existing one. In addition to this users would have easy access to other community facilities within the new campus.

- 5) Question raised: Is there any proposed change to the catchment area?

Response: The catchment areas for Cairn Primary and Gardenrose Primary will be amalgamated whereas the catchment areas for Carrick Academy and St Cuthbert's Primary will stay the same.

- 6) Question raised: What are the plans for the current school buildings?

Response: The Council's Estates team will look at the options for the existing school buildings and present options for the Council to consider.

- 7) Question raised: Is Cairn Primary School a listed building?

Response: Cairn Primary is not a listed building.

- 8) Question raised: Will Carrick Academy keep its name?

Response: Although Carrick Academy will be part of the new campus its name will not change.

- 9) Question raised: Will staff lose their jobs?

Response: It is not anticipated that any staff will lose their job as almost all staff will transfer to the new campus. There will be a reduction in the number of head teachers and possibly in facilities management staff. The Council has procedures in place to manage such changes which have been agreed with the relevant trade unions.

- 10) Question raised: Will the School of Rugby remain?

Response: There will be no change to the School of Rugby. Having the primary schools on site however provides an opportunity for the children to get direct access to the activities they offer.

- 11) View expressed: In light of budget cuts children should be educated together.

Response: The new campus offers the opportunity for all children and young people to be educated in the one location. This is a much more efficient model for delivering education than through 4 separate school buildings.

- 12) View expressed: Very young children should not be sent to nursery every week of the year.

Response: The proposal to extend the Early Years' Service to 52 weeks of the year is in line with the Scottish Government proposal to increase flexible learning and childcare options for all parents/ carers. If the proposal is adopted parents/ carers can choose the child care arrangement which best suits them.

- 13) Question raised: People are already using McAdam Way as a drop off for students.

Response: The new campus will have better parking and drop off arrangements for parents and they will be encouraged to use these rather than neighbouring streets.

- 14) View expressed: Concerned about increased traffic at the new Campus site.

Response: Overall the traffic management arrangements at Carrick Academy will be significantly improved as part of the new campus project. The campus proposal coincides with the new Maybole by-pass which, once in place, will greatly reduce the amount of traffic using the main A77 through Maybole which also passes Carrick Academy. Although most children and young people live within easy walking distance of the new campus, the parking and drop off facilities will be enhanced to accommodate the anticipated needs of the campus. This will be considered as part of the design process during which the people of Maybole will be given the opportunity to express their views.

- 15) View expressed: If you keep St Cuthbert's separate it will encourage bullying and bigotry?

Response: The campus proposal will help breakdown these barriers. Bigotry is not associated with schools and is very much a cultural issue that belongs to individuals or groups. The children and young people who will attend the new campus are the same children and young people who mix or socialise regularly in their daily lives either as friends or through the many community groups that operate within the town and surrounding area. The designs of the new campus will encourage the children to interact more through the use of the shared spaces particularly in relation to the dining and outdoor play area. The feedback from children highlights the opportunity for children to make new friends which in turn will help break down perceived barriers.

- 16) View expressed: The designs will be the key.

Response: We appreciate that there are many questions about the designs for the new campus which are not available at this time. If the campus proposal is agreed, the design process will begin once the funding is agreed. Throughout the design stages people will be given the opportunity to participate in the development of the designs through stakeholder sessions or focus groups. This will include staff, parents, children and young people, community groups and the wider community.

- 17) View expressed: You should be looking at the Campus being a Centre for Excellence and there are many examples that would put Maybole on the map.

Response: The new campus will be designed following extensive involvement by the community and will be a building that the people of Maybole can be proud of. It will be a transformational project and will have a wide range of facilities that meet the needs of the town and the surrounding areas and will be sustainable for the long term.

- 18) View expressed: Concerned that St Cuthbert's Primary will lose their identity and eventually close.

Response: The proposal is to relocate St Cuthbert's Primary to the new campus. The school's status and identity will remain, unlike the proposal for Cairn Primary and Gardenrose Primary, which are to amalgamate into one school. This proposal consolidates denominational provision within Maybole for the longer term in a way that the current building cannot. There are no proposals to close St Cuthbert's and any such proposal would require separate statutory consultation.

- 19) Questioned raised: Why not put a nursery into St Cuthbert's Primary?

Response: Early Years provision in South Ayrshire is non-denominational and is not subject to catchment areas. The Council is only consulting on the proposal to create a single early years centre within the new campus which will meet the needs of the whole town.

- 20) Questioned raised: Why close 3 perfectly functional schools and spend the money on upgrading the existing pool, golf course and roads?

Response: Although the Council has invested in Maybole schools, they remain of an age that they still require significant expenditure to bring them up to a standard fit for this century. All of the current schools are well under occupied and are costly to maintain. Moving to a shared campus will result in an arrangement which is more efficient, sustainable and cost effective for the longer term.

- 21) View expressed: Amalgamation should include a new name and uniform.

Response: The proposed amalgamation of Cairn Primary and Gardenrose Primary will require the new school to have its own name and uniform. This is something that the head teacher of the new school will take forward in consultation with staff, parents and children.

- 22) View expressed: Early Years should be for the benefit of the child and not a babysitting service.

Response: The expansion of Early Years provision is in line with the Scottish Governments proposals to offer 1140 hours of flexible early learning and childcare provision to parents. The new campus will be best placed to offer these choices to parents but it will be for parents to decide what early learning and childcare arrangements best suit their needs.

- 23) View expressed: Keeping the pool separate will reduce traffic at the campus.

Response: Parking at the new campus will be sufficient to accommodate people who wish to use the pool. Overall traffic management in and around Carrick Academy will be significantly improved by the new by-pass and the new campus.

- 24) View expressed: Amalgamation will lead to larger class sizes and would lose the focus currently given by teachers to children.

Response: This is not necessarily the case. Class structures are very much driven by the number of children in the school with staffing levels also determined by the number of children. The decision on what class structure best suits the school will be made by the head teacher. The Council already has a number of schools similar in size to that being proposed and the class structures have not been detrimental to the education or wellbeing of the children.

- 25) Question raised: Some history of the current schools should be included in the new campus.

Response: Normally some aspects of the past are included in new buildings without them detracting from the modern environment that a new build offers e.g. DUX boards. . The inclusion of historical artefacts can be discussed during the design process.

- 26) Question raised: Can ASN provisions such as nurture/sensory rooms be included in the new campus?

Response: This will be considered through the design process. It is normal however for schools to have a range of facilities that can be used to support children with additional support needs e.g. pupil support areas, nurture space, accessible toilets.

- 27) Question raised: Why is Minishant not included in the new campus rather than St Cuthbert's Primary as it also needs to be improved?

Response: The proposal only relates to the education provision within Maybole and not the surrounding areas. The primary schools included in the proposal are all within walking distance of the proposed campus.

- 28) Question raised: Concerned about privacy, disturbance and future development of old school sites?

Response: If the proposals set out in this document are approved the Council's Asset Management Service will explore options for the remaining buildings with the view that they would want to avoid the buildings lying empty.

- 29) Question raised: Where will the access be?

Response: It is likely that the main access to the new campus will continue to be off the main road. The detailed access, parking and drop off arrangements will be developed and improved as part of the design process and will involve all stakeholders.

- 30) View expressed: St Cuthbert's Primary school remain separate. Part of its success is its size and the staff are familiar with all the children.

Response: The Council is not consulting on a separate school for St Cuthbert's Primary. Although the school will be part of the campus arrangement they will retain their own name, identity and the staff that they currently have. Access to state of the art facilities will provide the school with new opportunities to enhance children's educational experiences, particularly in relation to specialist facilities.

3.3 Consultation with Children

Children were also given the opportunity to take part in the consultation process and their responses were mixed. Positive responses included the opportunity to make new friends, and getting new furniture. The children made a number of suggestions about things that they would like to see in the new campus such as a fitness room, improved ICT, bigger rooms, nurture spaces and better sports facilities. The children also raised a number of concerns including class sizes, the distance they will have to walk, the public accessing the campus, not knowing everyone and having teachers they don't know. The children raised a number of questions regarding the proposals which are listed below together with a response from the People Directorate. A list of the views and questions from children are contained in Appendix 3.

- 1) View expressed: Will the school times remain the same.

Response: It is likely that the opening and closing times of the campus will need to be reviewed to ensure the smooth management of the campus. Parents, children and young people and the wider community will be consulted about any change. The discussion on start and finish times is likely to take place during the design process.

- 2) View expressed: It's a long way for some of us to walk.

Response: Council encourages children, where possible, to walk to school as it helps improve their health and wellbeing. The distances involved are well within the statutory walking distance of 2 miles.

- 3) View expressed: Concerned about class sizes and not enough teacher time.

Response: There are controls in place which limit the number of children in classes. The actual class size can fluctuate from year to year depending on the number of children in the school at each stage. The head teacher will make the decision on the structure of classes for their schools. This does not necessarily mean that classes will be larger.

- 4) Question raised: Will there be disruption to learning.

Response: There will be no disruption to primary schools while the campus is being built. The schools will need to close for a few days to let staff move into the new campus. In relation to Carrick Academy, arrangements will be made for the school to continue during the building work. The arrangements for this will be discussed with the architects if the proposal is approved.

- 5) View expressed: Concerned about lunch time with older pupils.

Response: It is normal practice in schools for the lunch times to be staggered to avoid any overcrowding of the dining hall and to let children go in groups. The schools will decide what arrangements best suit them and the children.

- 6) View expressed: Concerned about the public using the facilities.

Response: The campus will be fully secured and a range of security measures including CCTV, fencing, door controls and separate entrances in place to keep children and young people safe at all times. The security measures will be considered during the design process and staff, children and the community will be involved.

7) Question raised: Will staff lose their jobs?

Response: Most staff will simply transfer to the new campus. The Council has agreed staffing arrangements for schools and agreed procedures for dealing with any changes to the staffing arrangements.

8) Question raised: Who will decide the uniform?

Response: The school staff, parents and children will decide on the uniform for the new school.

9) View expressed raised: Concerned about the change.

Response: If the proposal is approved arrangements will be made to increase the transition opportunities in the run up to the move taking place. This will ensure an element of familiarity with children and staff in the other schools before they move.

10) Question raised: Will the playground be split?

Response: It is anticipated that all of the primary children will play together but they will be separated from the secondary aged young people.

11) Question raised: Can we help make the school?

Response: The Council is committed to involving people as much as possible in the development of the new campus. Various opportunities will be provided for staff, parents, children and young people and the wider community to get involved particularly in the development of the design process.

4.0 Report by Education Scotland

The Schools (Consultation) (Scotland) Act 2010 and the amendments contained in the Children and Young People (Scotland) Act 2014 requires HM Inspectors from Education Scotland to be involved in the formal consultation process. As part of this process HM Inspectors undertook a number of activities in considering the educational benefits of the proposal. A copy of Education Scotland's report on the educational benefits of the proposal is attached as Appendix 4.

4.1 Process

4.1.1 Inspectors considered all relevant documentation provided by the Council in relation to the proposal, specifically the educational benefits statement and related consultation documents, as well as written and oral submissions from parents and others;

4.1.2 In addition, HM Inspectors undertook the following activities:

- attendance at the public meeting held on 20 March 2018 in connection with the council's proposals;
- consideration of all relevant documentation provided by the council in relation to the proposal, specifically the educational benefits statement and related consultation documents, written and oral submissions from parents and others; and
- visits to the sites of Cairn Primary School, Gardenrose Primary School, St Cuthbert's Primary School and Carrick Academy, including discussion with relevant consultees.

4.2 Education Scotland summary

4.2.1 South Ayrshire's Council's proposal to establish a new Maybole Community Campus which involves the proposed closure and amalgamation of Cairn Primary School and Gardenrose Primary School and associated early years provision and the proposed relocation of St Cuthbert's Primary School has clear educational benefit. This proposal will help ensure that future learners have access to modern accommodation, facilities and resources which meet their learning needs. The new campus has the potential to help teachers and other practitioners work together and develop new teaching methods which support Curriculum for Excellence. The proposal also supports continuity and progression in children's learning from age two to 18 in a new state of the art community campus. In moving forward with the proposal, it will be important for the council to continue to involve stakeholders in the design of the new campus and clarify those aspects noted earlier in this report where stakeholders require more information, and in particular the staffing and management arrangements.

4.3 Response to the main actions raised by Education Scotland

South Ayrshire Council welcomes the report by Education Scotland. The report is very positive about the campus proposals and acknowledges the educational benefits that it will offer to people. Officers from the People Directorate have considered the content of the report and although there are no specific action points, have listed below areas that need to be considered if the proposals are accepted.

These are listed below along with proposals to address them.

- 4.3.1 **Paragraph 2.2:** The Diocese had concerns about the potential for cluster links to Queen Margaret Academy being weakened. The Diocese stated that their support for the proposal would depend on these details being resolved to their satisfaction.

Response: St Cuthbert's Primary will remain a separate school with its own identity and the links to Queen Margaret Academy will not change. A new Queen Margaret Academy is presently being built which will help strengthen its links with its associated primary schools. The Council will work with the school and the Church to look at ways in how these links can be strengthened when the new school opens.

- 4.3.2 **Paragraph 3.5:** All staff want more information on staffing, shared facilities, traffic control and senior management arrangements.

Response: If the proposals are accepted further information will be provided to all staff. The staff will be involved in the design process for the new campus which will look at all areas of the campus including shared facilities and traffic management. The Council has also approved staffing arrangements for schools which have been agreed with the relevant trade unions. This includes arrangements when schools need to move location, amalgamating with other schools or are closed. The agreements ensure that the staff are involved in the process.

- 4.3.3 **Paragraph 3.5:** All parents are keen that if the proposal goes ahead that there should be opportunities for children and young people to integrate with each other, for example, through any shared facilities such as dining halls and playground.

Response: This will be one of the benefits that the campus will offer. Parents, children and young people will contribute and influence the designs of these areas. Experience has shown that there is general excitement among children and young people when they are involved in a new school project. This helps get their buy in and have a feeling of ownership of the project

- 4.3.4 **Paragraph 3.5:** All stakeholders who met with HM Inspectors want much more involvement and a 'voice' in the future design of the campus.

Response: The Council is fully committed to involve all stakeholders in the development of the designs for the new campus. This will be through stakeholder sessions, open sessions, focus group meetings involving a wide representation of groups from across Maybole.

- 4.3.5 **Paragraph 3.5:** Children are keen to be involved in naming the potential new school and in designing a new uniform.

Response: This will be part of the project delivery process and any change to the school name or uniform will involve input and consultation with staff parents and children and young people.

5.0 Review of the Proposal

- 5.1 The Depute Chief Executive and Director of People has considered the responses to the statutory consultation including Education Scotland's report and has provided an individual response to each of the points raised/views expressed and the action that will be taken.

Any issues raised during the consultation can be considered and dealt with either during the design process or through the management of the school should the proposals be approved.

5.2 Omissions and Inaccuracies

No omissions and inaccuracies were highlighted during the consultation process.

6.0 Decision making process

- 6.1 In accordance with the Schools (Consultation)(Scotland) Act 2010, this report will be published on Thursday 24th May 2018 and made available for further consideration for a minimum period of 3 weeks. Copies of the report are available at Carrick Academy, Cairn Primary, Gardenrose Primary, St Cuthbert's Primary, Council Offices, County Buildings, Ayr; Maybole Library, Carrick Centre, Maybole; Maybole Swimming Pool, Maybole Town Hall and Maybole Customer Contact Centre. The report is also available on the Council's website at www.south-ayrshire.gov.uk/consultations.

A report will be submitted to the meeting of South Ayrshire Council on Thursday, 28th June 2018 and will include a copy of the consultation report and recommendations for consideration and a decision.

- 6.2 After the consultation process is completed, Section 15 of the Schools (Consultation)(Scotland) Act 2010 allows Scottish Ministers to call in a closure proposal. The Council must notify Scottish Ministers of a closure decision within 6 days of the decision being made (including the day on which it was made).

Scottish Ministers have an 8 week period from the date of that final decision to decide if they will call in the proposal. Within the first 3 weeks of that 8 week period, the Scottish Ministers will take account of any relevant representations made to them by any person. Until the outcome of the 8 week call-in process has been notified to the Council, they will not proceed to implement the proposal approved at stage 10.8 above. If the Scottish Ministers call in the proposal, they may refuse to consent to the proposal or may grant their consent to the proposal subject to conditions or unconditionally. Until the outcome of the call-in has been notified to the Council, they are unable to proceed to implement the proposal.

If a decision is made to call in the closure proposals, Scottish Ministers must refer the closure proposal to the Convener of the School Closure Review Panels. The Convener is required to constitute a School Closure Review Panel to review the proposal within 7 days of the proposal being referred to them.

A Panel is required to notify the education authority of its decision within 8 weeks of the Panel being constituted.

Further information about School Closure Review Panels can be obtained from www.scrp.scot.

The Education Authority or any relevant consultee in relation to a closure proposal (listed in Schedule 2 to the Act) may make an appeal, on a point of law, to the sheriff against a decision of a School Closure Review Panel, under section 17D of the Act.

Proposed Maybole Campus involving the proposed closure and amalgamation of Cairn Primary School and Gardenrose Primary School and their associated Early Years Centre's and the proposed relocation of St Cuthbert's Primary School

Summary of responses and comments received.

- 1: Do you agree with the proposal to create a new community campus for Maybole Schools?
- 2: Do you agree with the proposed closure and amalgamation of Cairn Primary and Gardenrose Primary?
- 3: Do you agree with the proposed relocation of St Cuthbert's Primary?
- 4: Do you think that the option of including sports and leisure facilities (including a swimming pool) within the new campus should be explored?
- 5: Do you agree that the early years provision should be available on a 52 week basis?

Date	Status	Please indicate which school you are referring to in your response	Response to question 1	Response to question 2	Response to question 3	Response to question 4	Response to question 5	Summarised comments
20/4/18	Parent	Carrick Academy	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Except for the swimming pool and other sports facilities no other community facilities i.e. library should be moved to the new campus as it is not centrally located within the community
19/4/18	Parent	St Cuthbert's Primary	No	No	No	No preference	No preference	It would be a shame for St Cuthbert's to move away from where they are.
19/4/18	Parent	Gardenrose Primary	No	No	No	No	No preference	Questions were not answered at the public meetings. Concerned about the development of the existing sites. Concerned about access to the new campus, where it will be and when it will happen. Needs more information.
19/4/18	Grandfather	St Cuthbert's Primary	No	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	
19/4/18	Grandparent	Carrick Academy	Yes	Yes	No	No	Yes	St. Cuthbert's primary should keep its own building. Keep the existing swimming pool.
18/4/18	Parent	Gardenrose Primary	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No preference	I feel that the facilities and learning experiences/opportunities would be fantastic with all schools being on the one Campus. This is central to providing all children in Maybole with the same opportunities in education and in preparation for further study and career prospects.

Date	Status	Please indicate which school you are referring to in your response	Response to question 1	Response to question 2	Response to question 3	Response to question 4	Response to question 5	Summarised comments
18/4/18	Parent	Gardenrose Primary	No	No	No preference	No preference	Yes	
18/4/18	Parent	Gardenrose Primary	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No preference	
18/4/18	Parent	Gardenrose Primary	No	No	No preference	Yes	Yes	Concerned about parking. Whitefaulds is already busy.
18/4/18	Parent	Gardenrose Primary	No	No	No	No preference	No preference	Disagrees with the campus, concerned about large classes and infants mixing with older children.
18/4/18	Parent	Gardenrose Primary	No	No	No	No preference	No	Outdoor facilities for the St. Cuthbert's and non-denominational school should be shared to reduce sectarianism. Keeping them separate is just encouraging it.
18/4/18	Parent	Gardenrose Primary	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No preference	Early years provision should be available over school term for all ages
18/4/18	Parent	Gardenrose Primary	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Great news that a campus is being built
18/4/18	Parent	Gardenrose Primary	Yes	Yes	No preference	Yes	Yes	
18/4/18	Parent	Gardenrose Primary	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	
17/4/18	Parent	Cairn Primary	Yes	No	Yes	No	Yes	
17/4/18	Parent	Cairn Primary	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	No	All children should be educated together.
16/4/18	Parent	St Cuthbert's Primary	No	No	No	No	No	St Cuthbert's should remain where it is.
16/4/18	Parent	Gardenrose Primary	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Broadly in agreement with the proposal but feels that designs should be available to help people make a decision. Concerned about impact on teachers for Cairn and Gardenrose. Need to check the capacity of the new campus. Would like clear plans in place for the remaining school buildings. Concerned about segregation.

Date	Status	Please indicate which school you are referring to in your response	Response to question 1	Response to question 2	Response to question 3	Response to question 4	Response to question 5	Summarised comments
16/4/18	Parent	St Cuthbert's Primary	No	No	No	No	No	St Cuthbert's should remain where it is. Children will be educated better.
16/4/18	Parent	St Cuthbert's Primary	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	No	Maybole needs a new campus with better sports facilities. No need to include the swimming pool. St Cuthbert's should remain where it is but concerned that the building will not be maintained.
16/4/18	Grandparent	St Cuthbert's Primary	No	No	No	No	No	
16/4/18	Parent	St Cuthbert's Primary	No	No preference	No	No	No	St Cuthbert's offers smaller class sizes and catholic education. Concerned that it may be lost within the bigger campus. Swimming Pool should remain where it is.
16/4/18	Past student	Gardenrose Primary	No	No	No	No	No	
16/4/18	Parent	St Cuthbert's Primary	No	No preference	No	No	No	St Cuthbert's offers smaller class sizes and catholic education. Building is not in poor condition. Concerned that it may be lost within the bigger campus. Swimming Pool should remain where it is.
9/4/18	Parent	Cairn Primary	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Amalgamation of Cairn and Gardenrose and relocation of St Cuthbert's to a shared facility would help to enhance community spirit. Feels that some history/historical facts from each school should be represented somehow within the new structure. Would like ASN provisions such as nurture/sensory rooms to be included in the plans. New secure schools can only enhance the safety of the pupils and staff.
6/4/18	Parent	St Cuthbert's Primary	No preference	No preference	No	Yes	Yes	St Cuthbert's should have their own new build to preserve their own identity. Why was Minishant not included in the proposal? Use Minishant for a new St Cuthbert's.
29/3/18	Parent	Cairn Primary	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No preference	Concerned about what will be happen to the remaining school buildings and grounds. Thinks the campus will be a great thing for the kids and love a new super school. Will it still be Carrick Academy and a different name for the primary school? Agrees that a swimming pool would be great but would not like the public swimming pool in Maybole to close because of it. Would not like to see any staff lose their jobs.

Date	Status	Please indicate which school you are referring to in your response	Response to question 1	Response to question 2	Response to question 3	Response to question 4	Response to question 5	Summarised comments
29/3/18	Parent	St Cuthbert's Primary	No preference	Yes	No preference	Yes	Yes	
27/3/18	Parent	Gardenrose Primary	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Great idea, as long as provision for school of rugby status is continued through the build and beyond.
26/3/18	Parent	Gardenrose Primary	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No preference	Thinks the proposal for a new community campus for all of the Maybole schools looks fantastic.
26/3/18	Parent	Gardenrose Primary	Yes	Yes	No preference	Yes	No preference	
23/3/18	Parent	Cairn Primary	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Concerned about the new school being open plan. Makes it difficult for children to concentrate.
17/3/18	Staff Member	Cairn Primary	No	No	No	Yes	No	
16/3/18	Grandparent	Cairn Primary	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	
8/3/18	Resident	Carrick Academy	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	If the swimming pool is incorporated within new campus use of the pool during day will be restricted. Better keeping the existing pool.
6/3/18	Parent	Carrick Academy	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Feels that the three primary schools should be combined in the new proposals
2/3/18	Resident	Carrick Academy	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Maybole schools are in great need of modernisation especially Carrick Academy. Invest in education and provide an enjoyable learning environment.
2/3/18	Parent	Cairn Primary	No	No	Yes	Yes	No	
1/3/18	Grandparent	Gardenrose Primary	Yes	Yes	Yes	No preference	No preference	In light of budget cuts, all children should be educated together with the added bonus of the new facilities.
1/3/18	Resident	None	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	
1/3/18	Family member	Carrick Academy	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	
28/2/18	Parent	Cairn Primary	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	No	

Date	Status	Please indicate which school you are referring to in your response	Response to question 1	Response to question 2	Response to question 3	Response to question 4	Response to question 5	Summarised comments
27/2/18	Pupil	Cairn Primary	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	No	
27/2/18	Grandparent	Carrick Academy	Yes	Yes	No	No preference	No	Thinks it is shocking that they want to send these very young children to nursery every week of the year, feel very strongly and how unsuitable and damaging this is
27/2/18	Parent	Cairn Primary	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	No	Feels it is inappropriate for 2/3/4 year olds to attend nursery every week of the year. It is too demanding for the little children and not appropriate or necessary.
27/2/18	Parent	Cairn Primary	Yes	Yes	No	No	No	Early years provision should not be provided 52 weeks, these are young children who do not need to be away from home all that time, it is too much on such young children and then when they start school this is drastically reduced
27/2/18	Maybole citizen	None	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Swimming pool should NOT be included. Would mean less public access and would ultimately result in closure of Maybole pool. Proved not to work elsewhere -e.g. East Ayrshire
27/2/18	Parent	Gardenrose Primary	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	
26/2/18	Council Tax payer	St Cuthbert's Primary	Yes	Yes	No preference	Yes	Yes	Concerned about the Council funding denominational schools - why should 2 schools be separate on a shared campus - surely the most efficient move would be for a single school - in times of cuts and austerity.
23/2/18	Grandparent	Gardenrose Primary	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Agrees with sports facilities but the pool should remain where it is and separate to the school. Concerned about Macadam Way cul-de-sac being used as a drop off. Very supportive of the campus but not if our street becomes unliveable because of traffic.
23/2/18	Rep	Sportscotland	No preference	Reminder that Sportscotland is a statutory consultee for planning applications affecting outdoor sports facilities.				
23/2/18	Grandparent	None	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	St Cuthbert's should be included in the amalgamation.
22/2/18	Staff	Carrick Academy	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	The design is key.
22/2/18	Staff	Carrick Academy	Yes	Yes	No preference	Yes	No preference	

Date	Status	Please indicate which school you are referring to in your response	Response to question 1	Response to question 2	Response to question 3	Response to question 4	Response to question 5	Summarised comments
22/2/18	Retired	None	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No preference	
22/2/18	Former parent	Carrick Academy	Yes	Yes	No preference	Yes	Yes	
22/2/18	Maybole resident	None	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	
22/2/18	Local resident	Carrick Academy	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	After attending the recent educational conference in Edinburgh it was really welcoming that the strategy going forward for educational facilities is to build not just with education in mind but building a new school as the community HUB. I believe this is an excellent opportunity to bring back the community spirit back to the local towns of Ayrshire.
22/2/18	Staff Member	Carrick Academy	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes		
22/2/18	Member of public	Carrick Academy	No preference	No preference	No preference	Yes	Yes	Feels that the Council should be looking at a centre of excellence for sport and leisure in Maybole. Missed this opportunity in every other South Ayrshire education project. Alford in Aberdeenshire should be a model for Maybole to surpass. South Ayrshire does not list well on the Changing Places website. A swimming pool and excellent sport and leisure facilities would almost guarantee a Changing Place. South Ayrshire lacks a velodrome. Indoor pitches are something that would be much more beneficial than just a couple of astroturf efforts. Essential to have cutting edge stage facilities including a local theatre within the school, second to none accessible music facilities adjoining and if possible an outdoor amphitheatre like many other schools offer and a cinema screen. These facilities will attract people from across South Ayrshire and beyond to create a thriving community hub with plenty of new jobs to replace and relocate the ones you intend to make savings on.
22/2/18	Parent	Gardenrose Primary	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	A great idea. Children will benefit from up to date facilities and a new modern school.

Date	Status	Please indicate which school you are referring to in your response	Response to question 1	Response to question 2	Response to question 3	Response to question 4	Response to question 5	Summarised comments
22/2/18	Parent	St Cuthbert's Primary	No	No	No	No preference	No	Thinks the idea of moving St Cuthbert's from its original location would be a terrible idea as they need to keep their identity. Open a nursery in it and let the school thrive.
21/2/18	Parent	Cairn Primary School	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	
21/2/18	Former pupil	Cairn Primary School	No	No	No	No	Yes	To close three perfectly functional schools, one of which has served this town for over 100 years is ludicrous. Pupils will face a much lengthier journey. Use the money to provide modern sports facilities i.e. upgrading our pool, golf course and introducing other leisure clubs. This idea of one big campus is not forward thinking. Spend some money on our pavements and roads.
20/2/18	Parent and staff member	Carrick Academy	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Any amalgamation of the primary schools should include a new name and identity. The different stages should be allowed to retain their identities and children in the primary school should be allowed to feel like primary school children. Early Years provision should be for the benefit of the child, not simply for babysitting purposes offering long hours and 52 week provision.
20/2/18	Parent	Carrick Academy	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	At last something's getting done. All Maybole schools have been an eyesore for years.
20/2/18	Staff Member	Gardenrose Primary	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	The schools are in poor condition. A new modern school with modern facilities can only enhance Children's learning. New leisure facilities are also needed.
20/2/18	Grandparent	Gardenrose Primary	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Agrees with largely with the provision of sports and leisure facilities at the campus but does not agree with relocating the swimming pool. There will be less traffic at the school with the bypass being built and students could easily walk to the pool at its current site.
20/2/18	Grandparent	Carrick Academy	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	No preference	Long overdue and should be quickly made available to Maybole and surrounding community
20/2/18	Concerned former pupil	Cairn Primary School	No	No	Yes	No	Yes	Amalgamation would lead to class sizes being too large and would lose the focus currently given by teachers to pupils.
20/2/18	Parent	Carrick Academy	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	The town's childcare facilities were lacking and school buildings crumbling.

Date	Status	Please indicate which school you are referring to in your response	Response to question 1	Response to question 2	Response to question 3	Response to question 4	Response to question 5	Summarised comments
20/2/18	Parent	St Cuthbert's Primary	No	No preference	No	No preference	No preference	Our children attend St Cuthbert's because we wanted them to spend quality time with their teachers. The school offers this. If St Cuthbert's were moved to a larger school it would lose its uniqueness and the children would suffer greatly.
20/2/18	Other (please specify)	Cairn Primary	No	No	No	No	No	It will mean further to walk for parents and children. Concerned that more traffic in one area and the possibility of an increase in accidents. Amalgamated school may be too large if pupils with additional support needs can't handle too many people in one area. You have to look outside of the box and look at the other issues it causes by relocating a school and not just having just one school to save same money. Maybole already has a swimming pool; you could refurbish it or build a new one. A Muga or sports facility could be built at Glebe park.
20/2/18	Parent	Carrick Academy	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	
20/2/18	Parent	Cairn Primary	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Feels this proposal for a Carrick Campus is an excellent idea for the town of Maybole. Children will get a greater sense of community. The town needs better facilities for its young people and also the adults within the town. So the suggestion of a leisure facility is excellent as long as it can open to rest of the town. It would be welcomed and loved by all in the Carrick Cluster.
20/2/18	Parent	St Cuthbert's Primary	No	No	No	No	No preference	Not at all happy with the decision to merge the schools especially for St Cuthbert's. All this does is single St Cuthbert's out as different. Some people are very bigoted and see things as 'Rangers/Celtic' and would not want children to be part of a school where they may get bullied for being Catholic. Also concerned that the three buildings in the town will lay empty and become a hot spot for vandals. Why waste money building a new campus? Also concerned about the location of the Campus along the main A77 which is one of the busiest roads in Scotland and has no crossing facilities whatsoever.
20/2/18	Council tax payer	None	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	No	St Cuthbert's Primary should be closed and amalgamated in a new Maybole primary
20/2/18	Parent	St Cuthbert's Primary	No	No	No	No	No	

Date	Status	Please indicate which school you are referring to in your response	Response to question 1	Response to question 2	Response to question 3	Response to question 4	Response to question 5	Summarised comments
20/2/18			No	No	No	No	No	
20/2/18	Resident	St Cuthbert's Primary	No	No	No	No	No	
20/2/18	Parent	None	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Thinks it will benefit the whole community and the children will have a better learning experience. All primary children should be educated together and not segregated one primary school due to religion.
20/2/18	Parent	St Cuthbert's Primary	No	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	St Cuthbert's needs to keep its own identity.
19/2/18	Parent	St Cuthbert's Primary	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	No	Feels St Cuthbert's will flourish (if it is left where it is) and that Cairn and Gardenrose should join together within the Carrick campus. A small school will be more appealing to many families. Concerned that if St Cuthbert's moves to a joint campus it would inevitably close. Invest the money in new schools. Concerned about congestion. Leisure facilities are a great idea, the town has very little to keep children active. Doesn't understand the need for an early years' service 52 weeks of the year. It's more like a glorified babysitting service.
19/2/18	Staff Member	Carrick Academy	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	
19/2/18	Parent	Cairn Primary	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Thinks it is a great idea as I have 3 kids ranging from 2yrs to 12yrs and they will all be in the one area of the town for education instead of spread all over.

PROPOSED MAYBOLE COMMUNITY CAMPUS WHICH INVOLVES THE PROPOSED CLOSURE AND AMALGAMATION OF CAIRN PRIMARY SCHOOL AND GARDENROSE PRIMARY SCHOOL AND ASSOCIATED EARLY YEARS PROVISION AND THE PROPOSED RELOCATION OF ST CUTHBERT'S PRIMARY SCHOOL

1. Notes of Public meeting held at Cairn PS on 20th March, 7pm to 8pm

Number of attendees: **14**

- Would St Cuthbert's be kept separate within the new campus?
- Would there be shared facilities?
- Will the current class structures be accommodated within the new campus?
- Will there be a change to staffing levels?
- Will there be a manager for the Early Years provision?
- Children walking to school from the north of the town, will this be an issue?
- Has there been any thought given to a dedicated Additional Support Needs nurture space?
- Will every subject be available for secondary pupils?
- Will the swimming pool be relocated to the new campus and the current pool closed?
- If the pool is relocated to the new campus will the community be able to access through the day?
- What would be the process be for groups to access the community space and would let costs be reviewed?
- If community groups are accessing the new campus through the day would the pupils be secure?
- Would there be dedicated parking spaces for Early Years?
- Would the current Astroturf pitch be relocated?
- Would you expect Carrick Rugby to host home games at the new campus?
- Will the construction phase impact on local residents?
- What is the plan for the legacy sites?
- Would there be something historic or specific to Cairn be incorporated into the design process?

2. Notes of Public meeting held at Gardenrose PS on 21st March, 7pm to 8.20pm

Number of attendees: **21**

- Will construction traffic access the site via Whitefaulds Road, area is already congested and I'm concerned for the safety of children?
- Will 3 primary schools, a secondary school and linked Early Years provision fit into the site?
- How can moving kids from a settled school environment improve their education?
- What do you envisage the class sizes will be set at?
- Has there been any decision on future use for the current primary sites?
- How can you guarantee safety of children within the campus with the mix of age ranges and community accessing on a daily basis?
- Will the school have different drop off and pick up times for primary and secondary?
- When will there be plans / designs that the parents can see?

- Will St Cuthbert's be on the same site and will they have a separate identity?
- Will the playground space be shared or integrated?
- Will the primary schools have different uniforms?
- Why can't Gardenrose keep their separate identity and uniform?
- Nothing is changing for St Cuthbert's but Gardenrose and Cairn could have larger class sizes?
- Is it not a missed opportunity to fully integrate St Cuthbert's?
- Will there be more support staff to supervise the playground?
- What Head Teacher will we get, Gardenrose or Cairn?
- There are large groups of kids smoking on the perimeter of the academy site, would the new campus challenge these behaviours?
- How would you be able to timetable the required hours of PE?
- How will you integrate the Gardenrose and Cairn pupils in year stages once they come together?
- Will there be opportunities for the schools to integrate prior to the new build completion?
- Will the primary children all move to the campus at the same time?
- Are the children involved in the design process?
- If the Scottish Government funding isn't secured will the campus project go ahead?
- Will the secondary part of the project open prior to the primary completion?

3. Notes of Public meeting held at St Cuthbert's PS on 22nd March, 7pm to 8.35pm

Number of attendees: **9**

- Do St Cuthbert's need to move, is it an option not to go?
- Would there be an option to create early year's provision within the current St Cuthbert's site?
- Has the church given their opinion on the proposal?
- How would the integration between schools work, would there be shared facilities?
- Why can't we keep our school on this site?
- I would like a separate entrance for St Cuthbert's
- Will parents have an opportunity to influence the designs?
- When will there be plans / designs that the parents can see?
- What was the response from Cairn and Gardenrose parents when they were advised that St Cuthbert's would keep their individual identity?
- Would St Cuthbert's have separate play time and dining?
- What is the cost difference to build 3 new primary schools against a new campus?
- Is this about saving money or providing a better education for children?
- If we did stay at the current St Cuthbert's site could we not access the new campus facilities via an organised let?
- How would you determine the size of the St Cuthbert's part within the new campus?
- If the St Cuthbert's roll increases due to parents of non-Catholic children submitting a placing request with the attraction of smaller class sizes how would this impact on the delivery of Catholic education?
- Will you build a school that will last beyond 25 years?
- Will attainment improve with a move to a new campus?
- Will staffing levels be maintained?
- What happens if the council rejects the proposal?
- Have there been examples in the past where projects like this were withdrawn?
- Will pupil safety be a consideration with the increased volume of traffic the new campus will bring?



Proposed closure and amalgamation of Cairn Primary School and Gardenrose Primary School and associated Early Years provision and the proposed relocation of St Cuthbert's Primary School

Consultation with children and young people

School:	St Cuthbert's Primary School
Number of children and young people involved in the consultation	21 (Primary 5-7 Class)
Date of Consultation:	28/03/18

- I like the idea of having more people to play with.
- It's a good idea because I can make new friends
- I don't think it's a good idea because we know everyone in the school and there is no bullying
- I don't really like the idea as it might be too far away from some homes as Carrick is far away
- Will we have the same teachers?
- What will the school look like?
- I don't like the idea as this is the school where we have so many memories
- I think it's a pretty good idea as it's a better opportunity to make more friends
- The playground might be chaotic as there will be so many children
- If it does happen, can we help make the school?
- It's a good idea as it will let you have creative freedom to make new friends and games
- Can we have a swimming area and a gym area if we're getting a new school?
- We don't need to move

P5-7 Class also took a vote on the questions;
Do you like the plans set out in the proposal?

16 children voted YES
4 children voted NO
1 child was UNDECIDED

School:	Gardenrose PS
Number of children and young people involved in the consultation	94
Date of Consultation:	28/03/18

Questions

- Will the school closure time be the same?
- Who will decide on the uniform?
- Will there be a disruption in learning?
- How big will the school be?
- Will people lose their jobs?
- What will it be called?
- Will it have a big enough car park?
- Will it have a shared library?

Facilities children would like:

Swimming pool, STEM room, big changing rooms, AstroTurf football pitch/multi-purpose sports area, rugby pitch, more than one gym hall, big playground, signs for directions, playground games, lots of ICT, blind and deaf friendly classrooms, bike racks, use of science labs and music rooms, automatic doors, lockers, disability access, glass walls to make the school warm.

Worries/concerns:

- Not knowing other children from other schools,
- Less chance of getting into the football team,
- Public using the school's facilities e.g. swimming pool,
- Class size numbers, not enough teacher time,
- Lunch times with older children,
- Having teachers they don't know,
- The change,
- Further away from some houses,
- Access to the school.

Things they would look forward to:

- Excited to make new friends.
- Better educations –more supplies.
- Safer/better security of school grounds.
- New furniture, more comfortable.

School:	Cairn PS
Number of children and young people involved in the consultation	16
Date of Consultation:	17/4/18

What would you like to see in the new school?

- Fitness gym/ better gymnastic equipment
- ICT room
- A nice interior – calm colour, big corridors, a lot of light.
- Secondary school should have lockers
- Improved playground – more things for people to do/ sensory garden/ water features
- Swimming pool
- Lecture theatre/ drama stage area
- Library – a wide range of books
- Nurture room/ sensory room
- Big new office
- Modern – spiral staircases
- Bigger rooms for bigger classes
- Make it an eco-school
- Keep important things from the past
- New house groups – new names
- One school for the town is a good idea – you can be with your friends from other schools

Worries

- I don't want to leave this school.
- More people might get bullied in a bigger school
- Will there be a shared playground
- If it's bigger than Carrick is just now you might get lost
- It will be strange for this year's P7s – they will have 3 years in the old school and 3 years in the new school.
- All my family came to Cairn – I wanted my children to come here.
- It's a long way to walk / it's not fair for people at this end of the town
- We won't be able to get away from our big brothers and sisters
- I want to keep Tracey as our school cook.
- Who will be the Head Teacher? How many Head teachers will there be?
- Some people want it to be just a secondary school.
- Some people don't want the primaries to join.
- I don't want composite classes.

Name suggestions – Carrick Campus, Maybole Campus, Cairnrose P S.

Uniform suggestions –

Tie – dark green (Cairn) and yellow stripe (Gardenrose) or green and burgundy.

Maybe we should have new colours.

Logo – a Cairn wreath with a rose inside it.

Sports – a running track, football pitches, lots of competitions

8/16 were in favour of the new school

5/16 did not want a new school

3/16 were undecided.

Report by Education Scotland addressing educational aspects of the proposal by South Ayrshire Council to establish a new Maybole Community Campus which involves the proposed closure and amalgamation of Cairn Primary School and Gardenrose Primary School and associated early years provision and the proposed relocation of St Cuthbert's Primary School.

1. Introduction

1.1 This report from Education Scotland has been prepared by Her Majesty's Inspectors of Education (HM Inspectors) in accordance with the terms of the *Schools (Consultation) (Scotland) Act 2010* and the amendments contained in the *Children and Young People (Scotland) Act 2014*. The purpose of the report is to provide an independent and impartial consideration of South Ayrshire Council's proposal to establish a new Maybole Community Campus which involves the proposed closure and amalgamation of Cairn Primary School and Gardenrose Primary School and associated early years provision and the proposed relocation of St Cuthbert's Primary School. A new Carrick Academy will be built on the site of the existing school as part of the planned new campus. Section 2 of the report sets out brief details of the consultation process. Section 3 of the report sets out HM Inspectors' consideration of the educational aspects of the proposal, including significant views expressed by consultees. Section 4 summarises HM Inspectors' overall view of the proposal. Upon receipt of this report, the Act requires the council to consider it and then prepare its final consultation report. The council's final consultation report should include a copy of this report and must contain an explanation of how, in finalising the proposal, it has reviewed the initial proposal, including a summary of points raised during the consultation process and the council's response to them. The council has to publish its final consultation report three weeks before it takes its final decision. Where a council is proposing to close a school, it needs to follow all legislative obligations set out in the 2010 Act, including notifying Ministers within six working days of making its final decision and explaining to consultees the opportunity they have to make representations to Ministers.

1.2 HM Inspectors considered:

- the likely effects of the proposal for children and young people of the schools and early years provision involved; any other users; children likely to become pupils within two years of the date of publication of the proposal paper; and other children and young people in the council area;
- any other likely effects of the proposal;
- how the council intends to minimise or avoid any adverse effects that may arise from the proposal; and
- the educational benefits the council believes will result from implementation of the proposal, and the council's reasons for coming to these beliefs.

1.3 In preparing this report, HM Inspectors undertook the following activities:

- attendance at the public meeting held on 20 March 2018 in connection with the council's proposals;
- consideration of all relevant documentation provided by the council in relation to the proposal, specifically the educational benefits statement and related consultation documents, written and oral submissions from parents and others; and
- visits to the sites of Cairn Primary School, Gardenrose Primary School, St Cuthbert's Primary School and Carrick Academy, including discussion with relevant consultees.

2. Consultation Process

2.1 South Ayrshire Council undertook the consultation on its proposal with reference to the *Schools (Consultation) (Scotland) Act 2010* and the amendments in the *Children and Young People (Scotland) Act 2014*. The consultation process ran from 19 February until 20 April 2018. The proposal document was placed on the council's website. Copies were made available to numerous consultees, including Parent Councils, parents of those schools affected and those whose children could attend the affected schools within two years of publication of the proposal document. The document was also made available to stakeholders, including, children, young people, teaching and support staff, trade union representatives and the local Community Council Stakeholders were invited to respond to the proposal in writing or by email.

2.2 Public meetings were held at each of the primary schools involved. A total of 44 people attended these meetings. Those who attended had mixed views about the proposal. Overall, those who attended wanted more information about several aspects of the proposal. This included more detail about campus facilities, including any to be shared, early years provision, safe arrangements for vehicular access, class sizes and arrangements for managing the co-location of educational provision for children and young people from age two to 18. Stakeholders also wanted more specific detail about how the proposal would ensure that the individual identity of St Cuthbert's Primary School, based on Roman Catholic values, would be maintained. The Diocese of Galloway indicated that the Catholic Church would be willing to explore an arrangement to relocate St Cuthbert's Primary School to the proposed new campus which retained the provision in Maybole of a Catholic school community with its distinctive educational approach. The Diocese had concerns about the potential for cluster links to Queen Margaret Academy being weakened. The Diocese stated that their support for the proposal would depend on these details being resolved to their satisfaction. The views of 135 children's were also gathered. Most were positive about the proposal and wanted more involvement in the design of the campus. There were 87 responses from other stakeholders, including parent and carers, staff and other interested individuals, including local residents. Overall, the majority were positive about the proposal.

3. Educational Aspects of Proposal

3.1 The proposal has clear educational benefits and the potential for children, young people and the community to access modern educational and community facilities. Designs for the new shared community campus have still to be developed. However, the proposal makes reference to the new Ayr Academy and Tarbolton Community Campus as projects which represent creativity and flexibility in design and which have received national recognition. As part of a larger school population, children and young people would have increased opportunities to make more friends as well as maintaining friendships from their current school. Children may also benefit from opportunities through wider social integration that the campus would offer. With a new Carrick Academy to be built on the site of the existing school, as part of the new campus, the proposal has the potential to promote inclusion further. In ensuring that children, young people and others with mobility difficulties can access all areas of the curriculum, the facilities through the new campus have the potential to be fully accessible to those who have any additional support needs. The new non-denominational school would have an increased early years, teaching and senior management staffing structure. This has the potential to increase the opportunities for staff to share good practice and develop their professional learning across the campus.

3.2 The proposal has the potential to improve the quality of children and young people's learning outdoors, through, for example, outdoor classroom facilities, allotments for growing and social areas where children and young people could play and enjoy time with friends. In addition, purpose-built outdoor facilities would support and increase children and young people's health and wellbeing opportunities through being involved in a wider range of sporting activities. There are plans for the provision of two all weather-pitches, one for football and one for rugby. The proposal also has the potential to enhance children and young people's skills in digital technology as a result of improved information communications technology infrastructure.

3.3 The proposal for the new early years centre has the potential to increase places for children and help the council deliver 1140 hours per child. The new centre would offer extended provision, possibly over 52 weeks, rather than current term time provision. There is also the potential for families to benefit from accessing training and parenting opportunities. There is also the further potential to enhance all schools' relationships with parents prior to children starting P1.

3.4 Working in collaboration with other projects, the proposal notes that suitable arrangements will be made to improving the main walking route for children. Although a Maybole bypass is being developed, the current road to the school is very busy with a significant amount of heavy traffic, including lorries which at times can end up on the pavement at narrower parts when equally large vehicles are coming in the opposite direction. It would be important for the council to risk assess the route to assure themselves of children's safety.

3.5 Overall, most staff who spoke with HM Inspectors during visits are positive about the proposal. They see clear advantages for children and young people's learning through modern state of the art facilities, including for outdoor learning.

All staff want more information on staffing, shared facilities, traffic control and senior management arrangements. Children who met with HM Inspectors have mixed views about the proposal. Despite this, almost all are excited about the possibility of having a new school with new facilities and resources for their education. Others have concerns over the arrangements for children and young people aged from two to 18 learning on one campus. Those parents from almost all of the schools who met with HM Inspectors have mixed views. Those who were positive wanted their children to have their education in new purpose-built facilities with high quality resources. All parents raised reasonable concerns regarding safe routes to school along a busy road and traffic management at the new campus. Others are worried about the possibility of a 'truck stop' being established opposite the school entrance which they are concerned adds to the already high level of traffic on the road. All parents are keen that if the proposal goes ahead that there should be opportunities for children and young people to integrate with each other, for example, through any shared facilities such as dining halls and playground. Stakeholders valued seeing images and a blueprint of what a new campus might look like. Representatives from one Parent Council enjoyed visiting other schools in South Ayrshire to see what could be offered. All stakeholders who met with HM Inspectors want much more involvement and a 'voice' in the future design of the campus. Children are keen to be involved in naming the potential new school and in designing a new uniform.

3.6 Church representatives want to ensure that any relocation to a proposed new campus retains the ethos and values of St Cuthbert's Primary School and the school's distinctive educational approach.

4 Summary

South Ayrshire's Council's proposal to establish a new Maybole Community Campus which involves the proposed closure and amalgamation of Cairn Primary School and Gardenrose Primary School and associated early years provision and the proposed relocation of St Cuthbert's Primary School has clear educational benefit. This proposal will help ensure that future learners have access to modern accommodation, facilities and resources which meet their learning needs. The new campus has the potential to help teachers and other practitioners work together and develop new teaching methods which support Curriculum for Excellence. The proposal also supports continuity and progression in children's learning from age two to 18 in a new state of the art community campus. In moving forward with the proposal, it will be important for the council to continue to involve stakeholders in the design of the new campus and clarify those aspects noted earlier in this report where stakeholders require more information, and in particular the staffing and management arrangements.

**HM Inspectors
Education Scotland
May 2018**